

Manistee					
	Mills	multiplier	tax value	tax	45 yr total
City operating	17.7612	0.0177612	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 19,537.32	\$ 879,179.40
City refuse	1.15	0.00115	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 1,265.00	\$ 56,925.00
County operating	5.5	0.0055	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 6,050.00	\$ 272,250.00
Mi. St. Education Tax	6	0.006	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 6,600.00	\$ 297,000.00
Manistee ISD	2.3	0.0023	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 2,530.00	\$ 113,850.00
Comm College	3.0907	0.0030907	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 3,399.77	\$ 152,989.65
County 911	1	0.001	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 1,100.00	\$ 49,500.00
Council on Aging	0.3	0.0003	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 330.00	\$ 14,850.00
Dial a Ride	0.33	0.00033	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 363.00	\$ 16,335.00
County Library	1	0.001	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 1,100.00	\$ 49,500.00
Medical care	0.5	0.0005	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 550.00	\$ 24,750.00
Conservation District	0.1	0.0001	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 110.00	\$ 4,950.00
School Debt	2.25	0.00225	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 2,475.00	\$ 111,375.00
City Homestead	41.2819	0.0412819	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 45,410.09	\$ 2,043,454.05
Non-Homestead	18	0.018	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 19,800.00	\$ 891,000.00
Total	59.2819	0.0592819	\$ 1,100,000.00	\$ 65,210.09	\$ 2,934,454.05

Based on developers estimated \$2,200,000 Market Value (\$1,100,000 Taxable Value) for the \$8,600,000 project

\$	6,000.00	start of MSA	\$	18,227.42	end of MSA	\$	483,096.79	total MSA
	2	\$ 6,150.00		24	\$ 10,587.66			
	3	\$ 6,303.75		25	\$ 10,852.36			
	4	\$ 6,461.34		26	\$ 11,123.66			
	5	\$ 6,622.88		27	\$ 11,401.76			
	6	\$ 6,788.45		28	\$ 11,686.80			
	7	\$ 6,958.16		29	\$ 11,978.97			
	8	\$ 7,132.11		30	\$ 12,278.44			
	9	\$ 7,310.42		31	\$ 12,585.41			
	10	\$ 7,493.18		32	\$ 12,900.04			
	11	\$ 7,680.51		33	\$ 13,222.54			
	12	\$ 7,872.52		34	\$ 13,553.11			
	13	\$ 8,069.33		35	\$ 13,891.93			
	14	\$ 8,271.07		36	\$ 14,239.23			
	15	\$ 8,477.84		37	\$ 14,595.21			
	16	\$ 8,689.79		38	\$ 14,960.09			
	17	\$ 8,907.03		39	\$ 15,334.09			
	18	\$ 9,129.71		40	\$ 15,717.45			
	19	\$ 9,357.95		41	\$ 16,110.38			
	20	\$ 9,591.90		42	\$ 16,513.14			
	21	\$ 9,831.70		43	\$ 16,925.97			
	22	\$ 10,077.49		44	\$ 17,349.12			
	23	\$ 10,329.43		45	\$ 17,782.85			
		\$ 177,506.56			\$ 305,590.22			

Based on 2.5% increase in value each year.

Taxing Authority	net rent	2%		Annual 2%	45 year total
City operating	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.7631385	\$ 1,132.51	\$ 50,962.94
City refuse	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 73.33	\$ 3,299.74
County operating	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 350.70	\$ 15,781.38
Mi. St. Education Tax	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 382.58	\$ 17,216.05
Manistee ISD	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 146.66	\$ 6,599.48
Comm College	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 197.07	\$ 8,868.27
County 911	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 63.76	\$ 2,869.34
Council on Aging	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 19.13	\$ 860.80
Dial a Ride	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 21.04	\$ 946.88
County Library	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 63.76	\$ 2,869.34
Medical care	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 31.88	\$ 1,434.67
Conservation District	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 6.38	\$ 286.93
School Debt	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 3,780.00	63.76314	\$ 143.47	\$ 6,456.02
City Homestead			63.76314	\$ 2,632.26	\$ 118,451.86
Non-Homestead			63.76314	\$ 1,147.74	\$ 51,648.14
Total				\$ 3,780.00	\$ 170,100.00
45 year MSA					\$ 483,096.79
total 2% PILOT and 45 years of MSA					\$ 653,196.79

Taxing Authority	net rent	10%		Annual 10%	45 year total
City operating	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8156925	\$ 5,662.55	\$ 254,814.72
City refuse	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 366.64	\$ 16,498.71
County operating	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 1,753.49	\$ 78,906.89
Mi. St. Education Tax	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 1,912.89	\$ 86,080.24
Manistee ISD	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 733.28	\$ 32,997.42
Comm College	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 985.36	\$ 44,341.37
County 911	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 318.82	\$ 14,346.71
Council on Aging	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 95.64	\$ 4,304.01
Dial a Ride	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 105.21	\$ 4,734.41
County Library	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 318.82	\$ 14,346.71
Medical care	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 159.41	\$ 7,173.35
Conservation District	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 31.88	\$ 1,434.67
School Debt	\$ 189,000.00	\$ 18,900.00	318.8157	\$ 717.34	\$ 32,280.09
City Homestead			318.8157	\$ 13,161.32	\$ 592,259.30
Non-Homestead			318.8157	\$ 5,738.68	\$ 258,240.72
Total			318.8157	\$ 18,900.00	\$ 850,500.02

Developer projects reflect negative cash flow at the 12 year point and these projects are often "rehabilitated" along the term with a corresponding request for a new PILOT. Once the Tax Credits are received by the developer, there is little incentive to retaining the property as originally developed - the profits are front loaded. Something to consider.

A \$350,000 housing unit would have a Tax Value of \$175,000. With 59.2819 total mills the taxes would start at \$10,374.33 a year.

1 \$	10,374.33	24 \$	16,359.28
2 \$	10,581.82	25 \$	16,686.46
3 \$	10,793.46	26 \$	17,020.19
4 \$	11,009.32	27 \$	17,360.60
5 \$	11,229.51	28 \$	17,707.81
6 \$	11,454.10	29 \$	18,061.96
7 \$	11,683.18	30 \$	18,423.20
8 \$	11,916.85	31 \$	18,791.67
9 \$	12,155.18	32 \$	19,167.50
10 \$	12,398.29	33 \$	19,550.85
11 \$	12,646.25	34 \$	19,941.87
12 \$	12,899.18	35 \$	20,340.71
13 \$	13,157.16	36 \$	20,747.52
14 \$	13,420.31	37 \$	21,162.47
15 \$	13,688.71	38 \$	21,585.72
16 \$	13,962.49	39 \$	22,017.43
17 \$	14,241.74	40 \$	22,457.78
18 \$	14,526.57	41 \$	22,906.94
19 \$	14,817.10	42 \$	23,365.08
20 \$	15,113.44	43 \$	23,832.38
21 \$	15,415.71	44 \$	24,309.03
22 \$	15,724.03	45 \$	24,795.21
23 \$	16,038.51		
			\$ 446,591.64
\$	299,247.24		\$ 745,838.88 total estimated 45 year tax period

A single home purchased for \$350,000 would pay more in taxes than the proposed 42 unit project at 2% PILOT and \$6,000 MSA with the 2.5% annual increase. Note my conservative increase on taxes (only 2%) as they can go up by the rate of inflation (with a 5% limitation). This puts various "partnerships" into perspective.

It becomes an issue of equity. The Municipal Service Agreement (MSA) gives an advantage to the City of Manistee in revenue, since it is not allocated to other taxing jurisdictions. The only "shared" revenue is the 2% PILOT, yet all of the County services and mill funded activities are still available to the occupants of the project, practically without costs being shared by them. We have Manistee Place, Rietz Park Village, and the Century Terrace/Harbor View complexes with active (extended year) PILOTs now.

The City of Manistee leads the County by a wide margin in providing "affordable" housing for Seniors and general population, with Horizon Point being the single complex outside of the City (39 affordable and 10 market rate units). The County has 544 square miles, the City is 3.3 square miles. The County population is 24,420 (2014) and the City population is 6100 (25%). There is no other affordable housing listed for Manistee County other than the City of Manistee (and Horizon Point in Filer Township).